#  Citation: Ashra H, Barnes C, Stupple EJN, Maratos FA. Negative self-referential emotions and mental health in youth: The importance of self-criticism. Curr Res Psychiatry. 2021;1(4):63-67.

# The published open-access version can be found at:

# [https://probiologists.com/Article/Negative-self-referential-emotions-and-mental-health-in-youth:-The-importance-of-self-criticism](https://probiologists.com/Article/Negative-self-referential-emotions-and-mental-health-in-youth%3A-The-importance-of-self-criticism)

# or

# <https://probiologists.com/Uploads/Articles/25_637764340412247285.pdf>

# Negative self-referential emotions and mental health in youth: The importance of self-criticism

Ashra, H; Barnes, C; Stupple, E. J. N.; Maratos, F.A.\*

University of Derby, UK; Corresponding Author\*

**\*Corresponding Author**

Frances A. Maratos, Professor of Psychology & Affective Science

School of Psychology, College of Health, Psychology & Social Care, University of Derby,

Derby, UK.

 E-mail: f.maratos@derby.ac.uk

<https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5738-6491>

# Abstract

There are many measures available that survey positive and negative emotional indicators of wellbeing in children and adolescents (Žukauskienė et al, 2015). In fact, our work (Ashra et al., 2021) identifies 98 measures of negative self-referential emotions in youth populations. However, only eight of these measures incorporated an item examining negative self-referential emotions. This is important because negative self-referential emotions, especially self-criticism, are key antecedents of mental health disorders such as anxiety, depression and eating disorders (Löw, Schauenburg & Dinger, 2020). In this commentary, we discuss why measures relating to self-critical emotions are fundamental for children and adolescents, and much needed to comprehensively evaluate mental health and emotional wellbeing in youth. We believe our considerations here will enable scholars to: (i) develop robust self-criticism measures for children and adolescent populations, and (ii) reliably evaluate social and emotional interventions employed in schools and beyond, that are aimed at improving wellbeing through, in part, addressing self-critical thinking styles (e.g., compassion-based interventions).

**Key words:** Self-criticism, Mental health, Youth, Wellbeing, Child practitioners

# Commentary

The role of self-criticism has come to be regarded as an important element within psychological theory/therapies within adult populations (Rose & Rimes, 2018), with a comprehensive range of measures available for such. There is, however, a dearth of literature exploring the importance of self-criticism for emotion, social and mental health problems in childhood and adolescents, including its importance as a factor shaping the experience of emotional development. As young children are at higher risk of developing mental health issues compared with adults (UK parliament, 2020), the ability to produce effective measures of self-criticism is key. Indeed, it is common for young people with mental health problems to internalise negative emotions about themselves (Gilbert & Iron, 2005). Stemming from this, vulnerability to mental and emotional health problems can commonly arise due to a child developing a critical self-to–self internal monologue. In childhood, moreover, the development of self-criticism is a significant risk factor for depressive disorders (Adams et al., 2009) and is associated with a range of adult maladjustments including lower education and occupational status, dissatisfaction in relationships, and social maladjustment (Zuroff, Kiestner & Powers, 1994). However, research into self-criticism in childhood has primarily focused on *why* self-criticism develops as a result of negative childhood experiences through, for example, childhood attachments, maternal criticism and parent-child interactions (e.g., Carona et al, 2017) as opposed to, the effects of a critical self-to-self relating style. That is, there is no research, to date, exploring how a younger person engages and expresses self-critical emotions. This is fundamental to the development of any tools developed to survey self-criticism in children for non-clinical populations. Indeed, developing appropriate measures of self-criticism is of paramount importance as statistics reveal that one in six children suffer from a mental problem (NHS, 2020), and that since COVID-19, an alarming 80% of young people reported that the pandemic had made their mental health worse (Young minds, 2020).

In our recent review (Ashra et al, 2021), we presented the first systematic review of self-referential and self-report measures of negative emotions for use with non-clinical child/adolescent population. With the rapid growth of emotional-wellbeing measurements designed for use with children and adolescents (Pollard & Lee, 2003), finding suitable self-referential emotional measures, so that regulation of negative affect can be investigated, can be a significant challenge. We identified eight negative self-referential emotional measures suitable for non-clinical children/adolescents. However, whilst we found that the Child-Adolescents Perfectionism Scale (CAPS ; Flett et al., 2016) was evaluated as the most rigorous in psychometric quality, followed by the Children’s Automatic Thoughts Scale (CATS; Schniering & Rapee, 2002), one important finding emerging from the review was the paucity of measures to survey self-criticism, despite the importance of this self-referential thinking and emotional style portending vulnerability to future mental health disorders.

Definitions of self-criticism within the adult literature vary, but typically this emotional thinking style involves negative self-labelling and harsh judgement of oneself (Gilbert & Procter, 2006) including pathogenic qualities derived from self-directed negative emotions related to it, including shame, anger, disgust, and contempt. There is an extensive research base demonstrating that self-criticism is associated with consistent negative outcomes across various domains, including vulnerabilities to various forms of psychopathology, emotional well-being, psychosocial outcomes, academic success and responses to therapy (Zuroff et al., 2005). Additionally, a frequent self-critical emotional style has been linked to suicide-related responses within adult populations (McIntyre et al., 2018 for reviews). Most research has focused on adult populations (Löw, Schauenburg & Dinger, 2020), university students (McIntyre, Smith., & Rimes, 2018) and adolescent’s populations (Gittins & Hunt, 2020). Of the few studies that have focused on youth, similar findings have emerged. That is, adolescents who are highly self-critical are prone to a wide variety of emotional, social and mental health disorders, for example, low self-worth, a lack of confidence in abilities, problems with interpersonal relationships, the development of a negative self-concept and poorer academic achievement (Sahahar et al., 2006; Gittins & Hunt, 2020).

# Scant attention, however, has been given to the measurement of self-criticism in younger children. This literature caveat potentially reflects the lack of suitable specific measures of self-criticism for non-clinical child and adolescent populations. In fact, measures of self-criticism for children are limited to one clinical measure, specifically the Depressive Experiences Questionnaire (DEQ) (Blatt et al., 1976), which as well as an adolescent version (DEQ-A; Blatt et al., 1992) also includes a children’s version (CDEQ, Abela & Taylor, 2003) often used within non-clinical settings (for example Shahar et al., 2004). However, as noted by McIntyre et al., (2018), the DEQ was not developed as a measure of self-criticism but rather as a measure of interjective and anaclitic depression and thus, includes items about depression. Therefore McIntyre et al., argue findings of studies using the DEQ need to be interpreted with caution and recommended that further research is carried out using alternative or additional measures of self-criticism, such as the Forms of Self-criticism/Attacking & Self-reassuring Scale (Gilbert et al., 2004) or the Self-Critical Rumination Scale (Smart, Peters & Baer, 2015), both of which are adult measures and simply not appropriate for younger populations.

# To expand, children view emotions in different ways to adults as a consequence of their developing cognitive abilities. This influences their ability to experience and express different emotions, as well as their capacity to cope with and manage a variety of feelings (Thompson & Lagattuta, 2006). Complex emotions, such as self-criticism, emerge later in childhood because they require advanced cognitive abilities, most notably abstract thinking (Tanti et al., 2008). Indeed, it is only during middle childhood (e.g., 6 to 8 years) that children begin to develop the capacity to refer to the self, as a distinct physical entity, developing self-emotions and cognitions (Harter, 1986) as opposed to more concrete emotions (e.g., explicitly linking particular emotions to particular situations). These cognitive developments may contribute to heightened emotional vulnerability and self-criticism during childhood; especially during primary school years (i.e., child populations aged 7 to 11). This heightened emotional vulnerability during the primary school years has prompted many grass roots movements to ensure appropriate social and emotional curriculums are delivered in school settings. These include classroom-based Social and Emotional Learning programmes (SEL) or locally developed CBT programmes (e.g., FRIENDS; for review see Mackenzie & Williams, 2018). However, one specific social and emotional curriculum that may be beneficial for addressing self-critical style emotional thinking is that based upon compassion (Maratos et al., 2021).

Bringing Compassion based initiatives (CBI’s) into schools and the education sector has been advocated by many (e.g., Maratos et al., 2019). CBI’s provide young people with emotional coping skills, address bullying, increase resilience, and increase promotion of pro-sociality - all which culminate in encouraging positive and supportive learning environments (Welford & Langmead, 2015). Related to a self-critical emotional thinking style, CBI’s encourage not only compassion for others, but also compassion for the self, by decreasing self-attacking and self-critical ways of relating to oneself. Early benefits of employing compassion-based practices with school pupils resulted in gaining familiarity with affiliative states and emotion-regulation strategies (Karr et al. 2019). Most recently, Maratos and colleagues (reviewed in Maratos et al., 2021) have developed a 6-module compassion based PSHE curriculum for pupils transitioning from primary to secondary school. Preliminary analyses of this curriculum, using a robust randomised control trial design, revealed the specific compassion-based PSHE, as compared to standard PSHE, resulted in reductions in socially prescribed perfectionism, negative self-compassion, and the maintenance of stable trait anxiety (whilst this increased in the control group). In addition, thematic analysis revealed children found the lessons positively impacted management of their own wellbeing, emotions and behaviour, as well as class behaviour. However, an important caveat of this research was the limitation to measure self-criticism, because of the lack of appropriate measures as identified in our systematic review (i.e. Ashra et al., 2020).

Successful implementation and evaluation of CBI’s (and other grassroots social and emotional wellbeing curriculums) in primary (and secondary) schools requires understanding of how a young person perceives, understands and expresses self-criticism. This has been problematic to date, because conceptualisations and definitions of self-criticism have focused on adults, as noted above. Additionally, when children have been involved, the assessment of self-criticism in a child has been based upon adult inference and not self-report from the child themselves**.** This is problematic, as several existing studies indicate that adults’ perspectives are not the same as children’s considering the unique cognitive and environmental differences young people are faced with as compared to adults (Dex & Hollingworth, 2012). Certainly, involvement of children and/or adolescents during scale development enables a robust measure to be developed and improves the quality of the measurement tool (De Leeuw, 2011). In Ashra et al. (2021), however, we found that only three out of the eight negative self-referential measures reviewed involved children and/or adolescents as experts during scale development, and so their voice was missing in the development of the item set for the measures. Ensuring a child’s perspective is explored in respect to self-criticism will benefit researchers to create age appropriate self-critical measures for non-clinical child and adolescent populations, that can be used to: i) understand the prevalence of this negative emotional thinking style in youth and; ii) reliably evaluate child and adolescent mental health interventions, particularly those within educational settings.

# In previous research, some qualitative studies have explored perceptions and conceptualisations of emotions in youth; for example, self-conscious emotions (Ferguson, Stegge & Damhuis, 1991), pride (Harter & Whitesell, 1989), sympathy (Szagun, 1992) and self-compassion (Campion & Glover, 2016). However, qualitative research on how children perceive and experience self-criticism in the context of their daily lives has not, to our understanding, been investigated. In addressing this, our recent work (Ashra et al., in prep) includes qualitative study of understanding of self-criticism and a self-critical emotional thinking style in child (n = 33) and adolescent (n = 18) populations. Thematic analysis revealed children as young as seven used a range of alternative lexicons to refer to self-critical emotions (e.g., ‘I felt frustrated, annoyed, mean, unkind or angry with myself”). This is consistent with prior research by Baron-Cohen et al., (2010) who demonstrated that only circa 6% of children aged between seven and eight, and circa 33% of children aged nine to ten comprehend the meaning of the word ‘critical’. Indeed, in our research, self-critical thoughts and behaviours were demonstrated via: (i) Comparative Self-criticism: whereby children showed a negative view of themselves by comparing themselves to their peers. (ii) Feelings of being a failure: whereby children focused on feelings of failure and inadequacies, including feelings of self-blame and rumination on mistakes and failures. (iii) Negative feelings toward the self: whereby children demonstrated negative thinking and expecting the worse via feelings of anger, frustration, disappointment and shame towards the self and, (iv) Self-oriented perfectionism: whereby children expressed self-critical feelings as a result of high expectations and feeling ashamed if they were not living up to these expectations.

# Conclusions

Research on the importance of self-criticism as an important factor in child mental health is still in its infancy, with no specific child-friendly measure developed, to date, to enable accurate evaluation of this negative self-emotional thinking style in child and adolescent populations. The development of such a measure/measures is particularly important given early findings on implementing social and emotional wellbeing curriculums with children in educational settings reveal these interventions hold promise as ways to enhance emotional wellbeing and mental health. However, to develop appropriate measures to tap this important potender of wellbeing, fine grained, and in-depth contextual information on children’s understanding of self-criticism in their daily lives is necessary. This is important because evaluating the efficacy of wellbeing using intervention programs, largely depends on the appropriateness of measures (Richardson & Ali, 2014), and as we demonstrate above, self-criticism is a major antecedent to mental health problems that is a focus of many recent social and emotional wellbeing curriculums (e.g. SELs, CBI’s ) progressed with child and adolescent populations in schools or the local community.

**References**

Abela, J. R. Z., & Taylor, G. (2003). Specific vulnerability to depressive mood reactions in

schoolchildren: The moderating role of self-esteem. *Journal of Clinical Child and Adolescent* Psychology, 32, 408-418.

 Adams, P., Abela, J., Auerbach, R., & Skitch, S. (2009). Self-Criticism, Dependency, and

Stress Reactivity: An Experience Sampling Approach to Testing Blatt and Zuroff’s (1992) Theory of Personality Predispositions to Depression in High-Risk Youth. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin.* 35(11):1440-1451. doi:10.1177/0146167209343811

Ashra, H., Barnes, C, Stupple E., Maratos, F. (2021). A Systematic Review of Self-Report

Measures of Negative Self-Referential Emotions Developed for Non-Clinical Child and Adolescent Samples. *Clinical Child and Family Psychology Review*. 24(2):224-243. doi: 10.1007/s10567-020-00339-9.

Blatt, S., D’Afflitti, J., & Quinlan, D. (1976). Experiences of depression in normal young

adults. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology*, 85, 383–389. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1037//> 0021-843X.85.4.383.

Blatt, S. J., Schaffer, C. E., Bers, S. A., & Quinlan, D. M. (1992). Psychometric properties of

the Depressive Experiences Questionnaire for adolescents. *Journal of Personality Assessment, 59*(1), 82–98. [https://doi.org/10.1207/s15327752jpa5901\_8](https://psycnet.apa.org/doi/10.1207/s15327752jpa5901_8)

Baron-Cohen, S., Golan, O., Wheelwright, S., Granader, Y., & Hill, J. (2010). Emotion word

comprehension from 4 to 16 years old: a developmental survey. *Frontiers in evolutionary neuroscience*, 2(1*)*, 109, 1-8.

Campion, M., & Glover, L. (2017). A qualitative exploration of responses to self-

compassion in a non-clinical sample. *Health Social Care Community*, 25(3):1100-1108. doi: 10.1111/hsc.12408.

Carona, C., Rijo, D., Salvador, C., Castilho, P., & Gilbert, P. (2017). Compassion-focused

therapy with children and adolescents. *BJPsych Advances*, 23 (4), 240-252.

De Leeuw, E. (2011). *Improving data quality : Cognitive and social development and its role*

*in questionnaire construction and pretesting.* Retrieved January 20, 2021 from <https://www.aka.fi/globalassets/awanhat/documents/tiedostot/lapset/presentations-of-the-annual-seminar-10-12-may-2011/surveying-children-and-adolescents_de-leeuw.pdf>.

Dex, S., & Hollingworth, K. (2012*). Childhood Wellbeing Research Centre (CWRC)*

*Working Paper No. 16 Children’s and young people’s voices on their wellbeing.* <https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/181515/CWRC-00108-2012.pdf>

Flett, G. L., Hewitt, P. L., Besser, A., Su, C., Vaillancourt, T., Boucher, D., Gale, O. (2016).

The Child–Adolescent Perfectionism Scale: Development, Psychometric Properties, and Associations With Stress, Distress, and Psychiatric Symptoms. *Journal of Psychoeducational Assessment*, 34(7), 634–652

Gittins, C., & Hunt,C. (2020) Self-criticism and self-esteem in early adolescence: Do they

predict depression?. *PLOS ONE*, 15(12), 1-18.

Gilbert, P., Clarke, M., Hempel,S., Miles, N., & Irons, C. (2004). Criticizing and reassuring

oneself: An exploration of forms, styles and reasons in female students. *Br J Clinical Psychology*, 43(1):31-50. doi: 10.1348/014466504772812959.

Gilbert, P. & Irons, C. (2005). Compassionate mind training, for shame and self-attacking,

using cognitive, behavioral, emotional and imagery interventions. In P. Gilbert (Ed.), *Compassion: Conceptualizations, research, and use in psychotherapy* (pp. 263-325). Brunner-Routledge

Gilbert, P., & Procter, S. (2006). Compassionate Mind Training for People with High Shame

and Self-Criticism: Overview and Pilot Study of a Group Therapy Approach. *Clinical Psychology & Psychotherapy, 13*(6), 353–379. [https://doi.org/10.1002/cpp.507](https://psycnet.apa.org/doi/10.1002/cpp.507)

Harter, S. (1986). Processes underlying children self-concept. In J. Suls (Ed.), *Psychological*

*perspectives on the self* (Vol.4). Hillsdale, NJ, USA: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Harter, S., & Whitesell, N. (1989). Developmental changes in children's understanding of

single, multiple, and blended emotion concepts. In C. Saarni & P. L. Harris (Eds.), *Children's understanding of emotion* (pp. 81–116). Cambridge University Press.

Karr, J., Roberson, C., & Tiura, M. (2019). Kind warriors: A qualitative study of a

compassion-based intervention for children. *Counselling and Psychotherapy Research*, *20*(1), 39–45. <https://doi.org/10.1002/capr.12266>.

Löw, C. A., Schauenburg, H., & Dinger, U. (2020). Self-criticism and psychotherapy

outcome: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Clinical Psychology Review*, 75(10) 1808. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cpr.2019.101808](https://psycnet.apa.org/doi/10.1016/j.cpr.2019.101808)

McIntyre, R., Smith, P., & Rimes, K. A. (2018). The role of self-criticism in common mental

health difficulties in students: a systematic review of prospective studies*. Mental Health & Prevention,* 10, 13-27. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mhp.2018.02.003>.

Mackenzie, K.,& Williams, C. (2018). Universal, school based interventions to promote

mental and emotional wellbeing: what is being done in the UK and does it work? A systematic review. *BMJ Open,* 8(9):e022560. doi:10.1136/ bmjopen-2018-022560.

Maratos, F.A., Montague, J., Ashra, H., Welford, M., Wood, W., Barnes, C., Gilbert, P.

(2019). Evaluation of a Compassionate Mind Training Intervention with School Teachers and Support Staff. *Mindfulness*, *10* (11), 2245–225.

Maratos, F.A., Wood, W., Cahill., R., Hernandez, Y. & Gilbert., P (2021). Investing in pupil

wellbeing: A randomised control study of a Compassion-Based PSHE Pupil Curriculum. [Manuscript submited for publication]

NHS (2020). Mental Health of Children and Young people in England , 2020: Wave 1 follow

up to the 2017 survey. *UK. Government statistical Service*. <https://digital.nhs.uk/data-and-information/publications/statistical/mental-health-of-children-and-young-people-in-england/2020-wave-1-follow-up>.

Pollard, E., & Lee, P. (2003). Child Well-being: A Systematic Review of the

Literature. *Social Indicators Research,* 61**,**59- 78.

Richardson, D.. & Ali, N. (2014). An Evaluation of International Surveys of Children,

OECD SEM Working Paper, No. 146.

Rose, A., Rimes, K. (2018). Self‐criticism self‐report measures: Systematic review.

*Psychology. Psychotherapy Theory Research Practice,* 91, 450-489.

Schniering, C., & Rapee, R. (2002). Development and validation of a measure of

children's automatic thoughts: The Children's Automatic Thoughts Scale. Behaviour Research and Therapy, 40(9), 1091–1109.

Shahar, G., Henrich, C., Winokur, A., Blatt, S., Kuperminc, G., & Leadbeater, B. (2006).

Self-criticism and depressive symptomatology interact to predict middle school academic achievement.  *Clinical Psychology,* 62(1):147-55. doi: 10.1002/jclp.20210.

Shahar, G., Blatt, S.J., & Zuroff, D. (2004). Reciprocal Relations Between Depressive

Symptoms and Self-Criticism (but Not Dependency) Among Early Adolescent Girls (but Not Boys). *Cognitive Therapy and Research* 28,85–103. https://doi.org/10.1023/B:COTR.0000016932.82038.d0

Smart ,L., Peters, J., & Baer, R. (2016). Development and Validation of a Measure of Self-

Critical Rumination. *Assessment,* 23(3):321-32. doi: 10.1177/1073191115573300.

Szagun, G. (1992), Children's Understanding of the Feeling Experience and Causes of

Sympathy. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry,* 33: 1183-1191. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-7610.1992.tb00937.x>

Tanti, C., Stukas, A. A., Halloran, M. J., & Foddy, M. (2008). Tripartite self-concept change:

Shifts in the individual, relational, and collective self in adolescence. *Self and Identity, 7*(4), 360–379. [https://doi.org/10.1080/15298860701665081](https://psycnet.apa.org/doi/10.1080/15298860701665081)

Thompson, R. A., & Lagattuta, K. H. (2006). Feeling and Understanding: Early Emotional

Development. In K. McCartney & D. Phillips (Eds.), *Blackwell handbook of early childhood development* (pp. 317–337). Blackwell Publishing. [https://doi.org/10.1002/9780470757703.ch16](https://psycnet.apa.org/doi/10.1002/9780470757703.ch16)

UK Parliament (2020). *Child and Adolescent mental health during COVID-19.*

https://post.parliament.uk/child-and-adolescent-mental-health-during-covid-19/

Welford, M., & Langmead, K. (2015). Compassion-based initiatives in educational settings.

*Educational and Child Psychology*, *32*(1), 71–80.

Young minds (2020). Coronavirus: Impact on young people with mental health needs. UK.

<https://www.youngminds.org.uk/about-us/reports-and-impact/coronavirus-impact-on-young-people-with-mental-health-needs/>

Žukauskienė, R., Kaniušonytė, G.,Truskauskaitė-Kunevičienė, I. & Malinauskienė, O.

(2015). Systematic Review of the Measurement Properties of Questionnaires for the Measurement of the Well-Being of Children and Adolescents. *Social Inquiry into Well-being*. 1 (1), 40-75.

Zuroff, D. C., Koestner, R., & Powers, T. A. (1994). Self-criticism at age 12: A longitudinal

study of adjustment. *Cognitive Therapy and Research, 18*(4), 367–385. [https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02357511](https://psycnet.apa.org/doi/10.1007/BF02357511)

Zuroff, D.C., Santor, D.,&Mongrain, M. (2005). Dependency, self-criticism, and

maladjustment. In J.S. Auerbach, K. N. Levy, & C. E. Schaffer (Eds.), *Relatedness, self-definition and mental representation. Essays in Honour of Sidney J. Blatt* (pp. 75–90). London, UK and New York, NY: Psychology Press.